Racial Conflict

Are U.S. policies discriminatory?
By Peter Katel

Pro/Con
Is Black Lives Matter a valid slogan?

Pro
Jack Hunter
Editor, Rare Politics. Written for CQ Researcher, January 2016

If I told my fellow allies in the fight against abortion that "unborn lives matter," few would think I was saying that other lives didn't matter. It's hard to imagine abortion opponents even being offended at such an assertion.

They would implicitly understand that I was saying certain lives seem to matter less under our legal system and in our society. If some anti-abortion activists showed poor judgment or even committed violent acts in the name of their cause, few of the like-minded would suggest that this kind of behavior discredited the cause itself.

"Black Lives Matter" makes the same important point.

Overall, it doesn't matter if Black Lives Matter leaders sometimes do questionable things. It doesn't matter if some who champion this slogan sometimes take things to unnecessary and even deplorable extremes.

Those exceptions do not discount certain realities.

Black Lives Matter is an answer to a long-standing societal question: Why are African-Americans targeted and incarcerated at disproportionate rates compared with any other racial group? Why are they more often the victims of police brutality?

And why do more Americans not realize this is happening?

From Ferguson, Mo., and the killing of Michael Brown, to Baltimore, Md., and the death of Freddie Gray, to Charleston, S.C., and the deadly police shooting of Walter Scott, to a Staten Island, N.Y., sidewalk where Eric Garner was choked to death by the police for selling "loose" cigarettes. Americans continue to see incidents, time and again, where black lives do seem to be valued less than others.

Con
Derryck Green
Member of Project 21, the National Leadership Network of Black Conservatives. Written for CQ Researcher, January 2016

Black Lives Matter is neither a valid slogan nor a legitimate protest movement. The slogan's implication and the movement's emphasis are incongruent; it's an intentional mischaracterization. When one hears the slogan Black Lives Matter, one is led to think of an all-inclusive phrase and social movement that's focused on several pressing issues that have a direct and immediate impact on improving the quality of black lives.

But that's not the intention of the motto. Black Lives Matter isn't all-inclusive. It's very selective, because the only black lives that matter to this protest movement are blacks who were shot and killed by white police officers. Members and supporters continue to propagate the belief, with little evidence, that cops are systematically targeting and unjustly killing black people.

This perspective is thoroughly problematic. First, police shoot more white suspects than black suspects. Second, most of the black suspects who were shot and killed by police in the past year — many of whom were defended by Black Lives Matter — were criminals resisting arrest. Defending black criminals legitimizes and glorifies black criminality. Sanctifying black criminals killed by cops largely comes at the expense of black victims — and the movement's credibility — especially when more serious issues desperately need addressing.

Furthermore, the desire to be singularly identified as people who are targeted only because they're black is to embrace victimization. Black Lives Matter doesn't want any other group intruding on or minimizing its claims of victimhood, which explains the petulant indignation to the phrase "all lives matter." If "all lives matter," blacks' special status as victims is negated and the transparent and dishonest rationale for the
Not all of these high-profile incidents are the same. Some are murkier than others, such as in Ferguson. Some are quite clear, such as in Charleston, where a police officer now sits in jail, charged with murder.

But there is a pattern, one that is repeated too often. Many of these incidents that have captured the national imagination and begun important conversations about race have been caught on smartphone cameras.

Smartphone cameras are relatively new, but black Americans are trying to tell us that this type of brutality is not new. These problems did not begin with the advent of smartphones.

What critics like to portray as a movement needlessly stoking racial division is really just an abused minority finally giving voice to the violence they have long faced.

Black Lives Matter is an integral part of the ongoing fight to right unpardonable wrongs.

The disproportionate focus on the rare, alleged cases of police brutality and shootings intentionally diverts attention from the significant difficulties blacks face. Black women accounted for 37 percent of all abortions in 2012. Black illegitimacy is at 72 percent. Black children are disproportionately trapped in substandard and underperforming schools, preserving the educational gap between black and white students. Black unemployment is twice the national rate. Blacks kill 90 percent of black homicide victims. Don’t black lives suffering from these problems matter?

The selective moral outrage that favors black criminals over black lives in general invalidates the social and moral credibility of Black Lives Matter.